| **Student Name:** Tongtong Lai |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house opposes the narrative that sacrifice is necessary for achieving one's dreams |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Good opening. Give me an example to ground why this need does not exist. Explain what a sacrifice specifically is and why it is too much to ask.  Set-up   * Good work explaining how this narrative works as you were taught. Give me examples of these consistent sacrifices! We should characterise this as having higher stakes - so for instance how this narrative contributes to the glorification of suffering or pain in the process of achieving our goals. * On media - do people buy in to this? This is a superhero movie, so buying that this is what convinces people is not intuitive. * Build this out more persuasively - explain how people feel obligated to engage in sacrifice because they think it is necessary. Use realistic examples - of the way in which we depict successful people. * **You should push the counterfactual of a balanced approach that prioritizes well-being and enjoyment is more sustainable and ultimately more likely to lead to success. What do you support instead?**   Argument 1   * Is bad emotional and mental health exclusive to this narrative? We need to identify the in and of itself narrative; explain why the lack of truth has bad impacts; for instance, that it misleads people or makes them blame themselves when even if they work hard and sacrifice they cannot succeed. * What kinds of decisions do people make and how is this bad and what we do not want on our side? * We need to ground this - what are the sacrifices you are talking about here?   POI: Explain how this is far higher stakes! People work hard and have incentives to do so anyways; hard work is reasonable to ask people to do. Sacrifices are insufficient.  We could have also spent time explaining how this narrative convinces people that their dreams have very high costs and hence should not even pursue them in the first place. We can also argue how this narrative disproportionately hurts the underprivileged - people are led to believe equal amounts of sacrifice go in, but how true is this?  05:03 | | | | | | |

]

| **Student Name:** Alissa Mak |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house opposes the narrative that sacrifice is necessary for achieving one's dreams. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Talk about how this is exclusively about dreams - these are big things, which require lots of thinking, contemplation and seriousness. This narrative exclusively provides people with insight into what these big jumps and steps require. Explain why they would make bad decisions otherwise.  Set-up   * Is this about day to day sacrifices, or significant ones? * We need to explain why this **narrative** is what is necessary for people to be able to make better decisions. Why would they not make good decisions without it? Why do we need this narrative to exist? * You need to re-characterise this narrative to explain why it isn’t as bad as Prop claims. You have to establish how this narrative is mitigated by and balanced out through other narratives, such as those of mental health, the glamorisation of start-up culture, more class consciousness etc.   Rebuttal   * Explain why it was needed; but also how people internalise this outside. Why do people need to be told and believe in these significant trade offs; can people have it all? Which specific group can have it all - and why is this not the narrative to perpetuate? For instance poor people having to make more sacrifices etc.   Argument 1   * ‘Enhances their commitment’ is kind of roundabout! * You could have easily argued that people rush into making decisions, and that this narrative checks them and holds them accountable. It makes people more realistic when it comes to making risky business decisions, choosing non-traditional career paths and so forth. This argument requires you to characterise where and to whom this narrative applies. * Good impacting! Good on long term benefit.   04:32  Speak with more confidence! We’ve improved a lot over the past few weeks! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Tony Huang |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house opposes the narrative that sacrifice is necessary for achieving one's dreams. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Good on doing anything - explain why these dreams are so valuable and so necessary, and how sacrifice is unnecessary in this context.  Rebuttal   * Focus less on iron-man, and focus on the claim - in terms of need. How does this dream being their parents benefit you? Do you change this on your side? Alissa’s POI also points this out. * Did we engage at all with their claim that people need to be realistic and consider their commitment seriously?   Argument 1   * Give me examples of these consistent sacrifices! We should characterise this as having higher stakes - so for instance how this narrative contributes to the glorification of suffering or pain in the process of achieving our goals. * Build this out more persuasively - explain how people feel obligated to engage in sacrifice because they think it is necessary. Use realistic examples - of the way in which we depict successful people. * Why would they interpret the narrative this way? Where they focus on sacrifice more than their errors?   We need to identify the in and of itself narrative; explain why the lack of truth has bad impacts; for instance, that it misleads people or makes them blame themselves when even if they work hard and sacrifice they cannot succeed.  We could have also spent time explaining how this narrative convinces people that their dreams have very high costs and hence should not even pursue them in the first place. We can also argue how this narrative disproportionately hurts the underprivileged - people are led to believe equal amounts of sacrifice go in, but how true is this?  03:18 - let’s aim for four next time! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** James Gao |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house opposes the narrative that sacrifice is necessary for achieving one's dreams. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Why is it not necessary? Explain why people need to know sacrifice is needed, talk about the level of what a dream is and so forth. Then stop, explain what the structure of your speech will be, and then proceed. Always start your speech with a hook - and if you don’t know what it is - you have to ask! I’ve been telling you to use hooks for weeks now!  What is the structure of this speech?  Does it benefit your side to make this about small things like debating, or big things like leaving your job, or starting a new company? Is this about reasonable goals and desires, or really wild outlandish dreams and such?  Argument 1   * Why wouldn’t they make these decisions without it? * You need to re-characterise this narrative to explain why it isn’t as bad as Prop claims. You have to establish how this narrative is mitigated by and balanced out through other narratives, such as those of mental health, the glamorisation of start-up culture, more class consciousness etc. * Phrasing matters! Look at the POI Tony asks - the language to use is that people rush into making decisions, and that this narrative checks them and holds them accountable. It makes people more realistic when it comes to making risky business decisions, choosing non-traditional career paths and so forth. * Good work breaking the actor down into different groups and sections. Why is the behaviour you claim them to make likely?   04:23 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Christy Yuan |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house opposes the narrative that sacrifice is necessary for achieving one's dreams. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Explain why it isn’t necessary. You have to break this down systematically to be able to win on it.  What is the structure of this speech? You have to use clashes, and give me the names of those clashes in signposting. We had no clear structure to this speech - this cannot happen again!  Why would it cause them these problems? Why do they believe in this narrative in this way? Why do people prescribe to this narrative so highly that this is what happens to them? Build this out more persuasively - explain how people feel obligated to engage in sacrifice because they think it is necessary. We could characterise this as having higher stakes - so for instance how this narrative contributes to the glorification of suffering or pain in the process of achieving our goals.  Explain why people still try hard! What incentives to do so exist in the status quo? Capitalism, wanting to do well, society rewarding success etc.?  You need to spend time characterising the way in which this narrative impacts people in the status quo to pinpoint what the problem characterisation is. Is it that people just make bad decisions, or they glorify suffering because they think this is just part of the process?  What are these other ways? What is this step by step process? What are even examples of sacrifices you talk about?  Explain why the lack of truth to this narrative has bad impacts; for instance, that it misleads people or makes them blame themselves when even if they work hard and sacrifice they cannot succeed.  04:25 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Karin Yeung |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house opposes the narrative that sacrifice is necessary for achieving one's dreams. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | **1** | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Good opening - point out how it is just true that you need to make sacrifices. Take it out of the round and win on this issue clearly.  Our signposting is too descriptive. You need to use clashes, and tell me the names of these clashes instead! If we don’t know how to do this, you need to ask!  On extremity - you need to re-characterise this narrative to explain why it isn’t as bad as Prop claims. You have to establish how this narrative is mitigated by and balanced out through other narratives, such as those of mental health, the glamorisation of start-up culture, more class consciousness etc.  Sacrifice is helpful? You could have argued that people rush into making decisions, and that this narrative checks them and holds them accountable. It makes people more realistic when it comes to making risky business decisions, choosing non-traditional career paths and so forth. This requires you to characterise where and to whom this narrative applies.  Good that they don’t give up as easily - explain how this is what both sides want to achieve in this debate; create people who are wise, reasonable, but empowered.  We need to explain why this **narrative** is what is necessary for people to be able to make better decisions. Why would they not make good decisions without it? Why do we need this narrative to exist?  What even is a dream? Is this about reasonable goals and desires, or really wild outlandish dreams and such? | | | | | | |